# WEST BENGAL ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL

#### Present-

The Hon'ble Justice Soumitra Pal, Hon'ble Chairman

& The Hon'ble P. Ramesh Kumar, Administrative Member.

		<del>,</del>
Serial No. and	Order of the Tribunal with signature	Office action with date
Date of order.	2	and dated signature of parties when necessary
1		3
2	Case No OA-160 of 2020: Tanmoy Chatterjee -Vs-	
$\frac{2}{05.03.2020}$	The State of West Bengal & Ors.  Case No. OA 161 of 2020 a Subbas Chandra Patra. Va.	
03.03.2020	Case No OA-161 of 2020: Subhas Chandra Patra -Vs- The State of West Bengal & Ors.	
	Case No OA-162 of 2020 : Anup Kumar Sarkar -Vs-	
	The State of West Bengal & Ors.	
	Case No OA-164 of 2020: Laltu Majumder -Vs- The	
	State of West Bengal & Ors.	
	Case No OA-165 of 2020 : Nitai Chandra Josh -Vs- The State of West Bengal & Ors.	
	The State of West Bengar & Ols.	
	For All Applications	
	For the Applicants: Mr. S. Chatterjee,	
	Mr. S.S. Roy,	
	Advocates	
	For the Respondents : Mr. S. Ghosh,	
	Advocate.	
	The matters have come up under the heading	
	"New Application". Since issues in the five Original	
	Applications, appearing in today's cause list as item nos.	
	1 to 5, being O.A. 160 of 2020, O.A. 161 of 2020, O.A.	
	162 of 2020, O.A. 164 of 2020 and O.A. 165 of 2020, are	
	identical, the matters are being heard analogously. We	
	find that copies of the applications have already been	
	served on the State respondents and the State respondents	
	have entered appearance.	
	In these applications the applicants are contractual	
	workers and are working for a few years. It has been	

Form No.	
i Official.	••••

Vs.

Serial No. and	Order of the Tribunal with signature	Office action with date
Date of order. 1	2	and dated signature of parties when necessar
	stated that for the purpose of filling up the post of Driver	3
	an advertisement dated 20 <sup>th</sup> February, 2020 was published	
	wherein it was communicated that online registration and	
	submission of application would be allowed on the	
	website on and from 20 <sup>th</sup> February, 2020 to 4 <sup>th</sup> March,	
	2020. The applicants, who are general candidates, have	
	stated that as the age limit for general candidates is 40	
	years and as they are working for a number of years as	
	contractual workers, directions may be issued upon the	
	respondents to participate in the selection process by	
	relaxing the age bar.	
	Mr. S. Chatterjee, learned advocate for the	
	applicants relying on the unreported judgements of the	
	High Court passed in W.P. No. 226 (W) of 2020: Sidhesh	
	Mishra vs. The State of West Bengal & Others and in	
	W.P. 4027 (W) of 2020 : Mirza Nur Alam vs. The State of	
	West Bengal & Others and the judgement of the Tribunal	
	in O.A. 532 of 2018 : Krishna Gopal Roy vs. The State of	
	West Bengal & Others, submits that appropriate directions	
	may be issued upon the respondents to consider the	
	candidatures of the applicants and to allow them to	
	participate in the selection process.	
	Mr. S. Ghosh, learned advocate for the State	
	respondents submits that in view of the judgement passed	

Form No.	
i Oilli NO.	***************************************

Vs.

Case No.

Serial No. and Date of order. 1	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary 3
	by the High Court in WPST No. 53 of 2018 ( The	
	Chairman, Public Service Commission, West Bengal –Vs-	
	Palash Kumar Samanta & Ors), as relaxation of age bar of	
	the applicants is not permissible, no order may be passed.	
	Moreover, the selection process has been concluded on 4 <sup>th</sup>	
	March, 2020.	
	In reply Mr. Chatterjee submits that as the	
	representations dated 24 <sup>th</sup> February, 2020 were furnished	
	before the Secretary and Controller of Examinations, West	
	Bengal Health Recruitment Board, the respondent no.4,	
	for condoning the age and as the original applications	
	were filed on 28 <sup>th</sup> February, 2020, directions may be	
	issued upon the State respondents to consider their	
	applications for relaxation of age to enable them to appear	
	in the selection process.	
	Heard learned advocates for the parties.	
	Admittedly the applicants in the original applications are	
	working on contractual basis for the past few years. The	
	advertisement for recruitment to the post of Drivers in the	
	General category with age limit of 40 years was published	
	in the newspapers and it was communicated that online	
	registration and submission of application would be	
	allowed on the website on and from 20 <sup>th</sup> February, 2020 to	
	4 <sup>th</sup> March, 2020. It appears that the candidates are over	

Form No.	
	Vs.

Case No.		
Serial No. and Date of order. 1	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessar
	aged. Prayer is for a direction upon the applicants to	
	consider their representations for relaxing the upper age	
	limit to enable them to participate in the selection process.	
	In our opinion in view of the judgement passed in The	
	Chairman, Public Service Commission, West Bengal –Vs-	
	Palash Kumar Samanta (supra) as relaxation of age cannot	
SCN.	be granted, no order can be passed on the applications.	
	The orders passed in Sidhesh Mishra (supra), Mirza Nur	
	Alam (supra) and the judgement of the Tribunal passed in	
	Krishna Gopal Roy (supra) do not come to the aid of the	
	applicants as therein the selection process was yet to be	
	held, whereas in the instant applications, the selection	
	process has been concluded on 4 <sup>th</sup> March, 2020. Hence no	
	order is passed on the applications. The applications are	
	disposed of.	
	(P. Ramesh Kumar) (Soumitra Pal) MEMBER (A) CHAIRMAN	